

5213-0

IDRC-LIB

**IMPACT EVALUATION STUDY OF EDI
INFRASTRUCTURE AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES
IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA
1985-1989
FINAL REPORT**

by
Suzanne Taschereau

May 1990

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
1	Introduction
	. Background
	. Purpose of this Study
2.	The Work of the Infrastructure and Urban Development Division (EDINU) in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA)
	. Introduction to the General Situation in SSA
	. Concerns of Infrastructure and Urban Development in SSA
	. EDINU's Work in SSA: General Approaches
	. Sector Strategies and Summary of Activities
3.	The Evaluation Approach
	. General Approach
	. Target Selection
	. Survey Modes and Instruments
	. Sample Selection
	. Representation and Quality of Responses
4.	Findings - Impacts on Policy
	. Impact of Senior Policy Seminars (SPS)
	. Impact of Economic Sector Management Seminars and Training of Trainers Seminars (ESM and ToT)
	. EDINU Contributions to Policy Outcomes
	. Contributing Factors in the environment
	. Participants' Suggestions for Improvement of EDINU Impact on Policy

ARCHIV
TASCH
no. 1

5.	Findings - Impacts on Institutional Capacity Building	
	. Impact of Training of Trainers seminars	23
	. Impact of Bilateral Collaboration with Training Institutions in SPS and ESM Activities	25
	. Impact of EDI and World Bank Long-Term Collaboration and Support on ESAMI's Capability in Transport	27
	. Impact of Two Round Tables on the Establishment of a West African Network on Urban Finance and Management Training	30
6.	Analysis of Finding and Implications	
	. Impact of EDINU Activities on Policy Innovation and Management	32
	. Impact of EDINU Activities on Strengthening of Capabilities of Training Institutions	37
7.	Recommendations	43

Annexes

GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS

AfDB/TC:	African Development Bank Training Centre (Abidjan)
CEFIGRE:	Centre de Formation Internationale à la Gestion des Ressources en Eau (France)
CESAG:	Centre Africain d'Etudes Supérieures de Gestion (Dakar)
CIDA:	Canadian International Development Agency (Ottawa)
CRAU:	Centre de Recherches Architecturales et Urbaines (Abidjan)
DCL:	Direction des Collectivités Locales (Dakar and Abidjan)
EAU:	Ecole d'Architecture et d'Urbanisme (Dakar)
EDI:	Economic Development Institute of the World Bank
EDINU:	Infrastructure and Urban Development Division of EDI
ENA:	Ecole Nationale d'Administration (Dakar and Abidjan)
ESAMI:	Eastern and Southern Africa Management Institute (Arusha)
ESM:	Economic and Sector Management Seminars
IDRC:	International Development Research Centre (Ottawa)
NITT:	Nigerian Institute of Transport Technology
RHUDO:	Regional Housing and Urban Development Organization of U.S.A.I.D
SPS:	Senior Policy Seminar
SSA:	Sub-Saharan Africa
SSATP:	Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Program
ToT:	Training of Trainers Seminars
UADE:	Union Africaine des Distributeurs d'Eau (Dakar)
UNCHS:	United Nations Center for Human Settlements (Nairobi)
UNEDIL:	Joint UNDP-EDI-ILO project in support of African training institutes
USAID:	United States Agency for International Development

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project required the assistance of a large number of persons. All were extremely generous with their time and invaluable experience.

First, I would like to thank the staff of EDINU for their collaboration throughout the life of this project. Mr. Armand Van Nimmen, Chief of the Infrastructure and Urban Development Division of EDI, provided thorough briefings on the background of the programs and its expectations, key questions to ask and extensive documentation. Messrs. Steve Carapetis, Hernan Levy, Jean Mazurelle, Fritz Rodriguez and Maurico Silva of EDINU showed a great deal of patience in answering the many questions posed to them, in reviewing the many documents and providing constructive suggestions. Messrs. Steve Carapetis, Jean Mazurelle and Fritz Rodriguez accompanied me and were extremely supportive during the field mission part of the study.

I am grateful to Professor Harvey Lithwick, of the School of Public Administration of Carleton University, who encouraged me in this project and whose guidance was exceptional. Prof. Lithwick developed the evaluation framework for EDI which was used as a basis for the methodological approach in this study. While his proposed framework was not wholly applied, his wise suggestions contributed to the adoption of a rigorous approach in the evaluation.

I am also grateful to the International Development Research Centre management who agreed to my secondment to EDI, to program officers who agreed to share their experience with me, and to colleagues from my Division who were supportive throughout.

This study required a tremendous amount of logistical support and would not have been possible without the efficient and thoroughly professional assistance of EDINU and World Bank staff: Ms. Sylvia Patterson of EDINU in Washington assisted in preparing and mailing letters to participants and survey questionnaires. Mrs. Veena Basker and Hanna King, also of EDINU in Washington were of tremendous support in making travel arrangements. Staff in World Bank resident missions in Zimbabwe, Nairobi, Ghana, Senegal and Côte d'Ivoire were also extremely helpful in making interview arrangements.

World Bank resident mission representatives in Zimbabwe, Ghana and Senegal were also very kind with their time and provided useful insights. Their cooperation, and that of World Bank staff in Washington was also appreciated.

Finally, and more importantly, I would like to express my sincere appreciation to the more than 100 African participants and staff members of training institutions who took the time to discuss with me, in a frank and thorough manner, the impact of EDINU activities on themselves, their work and their countries, and who provided helpful suggestions on possible improvements. This report could not capture the richness, the complexity and the drama unfolding in each of these individuals' situations. However, it is my sincere hope that I have accurately reflected the views of those who participated in this project, and that recommendations that have been made will prove to be useful.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In its 1990 Strategic Plan, EDI embarked on a five-year effort to systematically assess the impact of its activities by sector and by region. EDI proposed to undertake this cycle of evaluations beginning with the activities pursued in and for Sub-Saharan Africa by the Infrastructure and Urban Development Division (EDINU) during the period from FY 1985 to FY 1989.

The purpose of the study was to provide EDINU with a measure of the contribution of their various activities in Sub-Saharan Africa carried out from FY85 to FY89 on the following objectives which it pursued:

- i. to assist policy makers and sector managers to establish improved policy and strategy frameworks for the cost-efficient supply of infrastructure services; and
- ii. to develop the capabilities of African partner institutions to offer programs in key aspects of infrastructure policy and sector management.

Activities carried out by the Transport, the Urban and the Water sectors were reviewed. Indicators of impact on individuals, on their institutions and on policy processes were identified for each sector.

Data on policy development and institution-building impacts were obtained mostly through open-ended personal interviews in a stratified sample of visited countries, based on a set of guidelines, with key questions identified. Third parties were interviewed to validate information from participants. A questionnaire was sent to some participants in Transport to broaden representation of the sample.

A majority of the 114 interviews were carried out in four African countries : Zimbabwe, Ghana, Senegal and the Ivory Coast. Nine institutions were visited including ESAMI in Tanzania. 18 additional questionnaires were received by mail.

Findings are reported for each objective pursued by EDINU. Impacts on seminar participants' knowledge and skills are reported, as well as actions they carried out when they returned to work. Impacts of those actions on policy processes, sector management and institution strengthening are also identified.

Analysis of the findings of this evaluation suggest that EDINU has played an instrumental

and facilitating role in furthering the dialogue between policy makers in the countries, and with the World Bank, in some cases bringing parties closer together in defining policy options. EDINU, with the Senior Policy Seminars, has created fora for dialogue on policy where they didn't exist.

Materials, especially summaries of deliberations, have been used to further the dialogue in-country.

EDINU Economic and Sector Management seminars have resulted in increased skills in financial analysis and planning. These skills have been supportive of and used in World Bank sector projects in SSA, particularly where training capacity in those skills was not available in the region. Application of newly acquired knowledge and skills by participants depended on whether they were in a position to implement, on the policy environment in their country, on support from their leadership and institutional capacity to implement. Finally, EDINU has facilitated links with donor agencies which have resulted in funding for projects supportive of policy and sector management reforms.

Policy development was identified by participants to be a long-term process requiring a critical mass of support at both the policy making and policy implementing levels, as well as focused and sustained efforts. In order to increase its impact on policy, it was suggested that EDINU focus its interventions more and ensure follow-up on its activities.

Impacts of activities on strengthening of capacities of training institutions depended on the nature of interventions on the one hand, and on perceived needs of african institutions. Findings are reported as a series of case studies. Generally, impacts were found when support was sustained over time and when the nature of the activity was appropriate to the capacity-building needs of the institution (in the case of ESAMI, for example). Keeping in mind the difficulties of institution-building in SSA, the absence of systematic analysis of institutions needs and capabilities on the one hand, and of EDINU realistic possibilities for support on the other, has led to disappointing results for both partners.

Recommendations are made that:

1. EDINU shift from organizing discrete training events to developing 3 to 5 year sector programs
2. EDINU focus the content and target population of training activities for greater impact
3. EDINU ensure follow-up on its activities
4. EDINU systematically assess partner institutions' needs and existing capabilities as a basis to determine the type of activities which are required to lead to capacity building

5. EDINU increase its collaboration with other divisions of EDI, with operational departments of the World Bank and with donors
6. the World Bank address EDI's institutional constraints (human resources and budgetary) to increasing impact on policy and capacity building of African training institutions.

Concrete suggestions are made to facilitate implementation of these recommendations.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background

1.1 In its 1990 Strategic Plan, EDI embarked on a five year effort to systematically assess the impact of its activities by sector and by region. The purpose of such impact evaluations was to assess its contributions, to ensure that "its main interventions... respond sufficiently pointedly to an important need, and that the effect be as great as it can be, for the targeted country's operating agencies, their training institutions, and the Bank's own understanding of the development problem and process, and its future cooperation with the countries." (para 1.15).

1.2 EDI has proposed to undertake this cycle of impact evaluations beginning with the activities pursued in and for Sub-Saharan Africa by the Infrastructure and Urban Development Division (EDINU) during the period from FY 1985 to FY 1989.

1.3 The 1990 Strategic Plan recognizes the difficulty of doing impact evaluation. EDI's interventions are in the domain of policy and institutional development. Both are complex process domains, where any number of factors either internal (such as policy environment, institutional capacity within a given country or financial constraints, for example) or external (such as multiple donor interventions) come into play. How can one isolate cause and effect relationships and attribute observed impacts to EDI activities alone? A literature search yielded little useful information. Training Institutes and Development Agencies have generally made few attempts at evaluating the impact of their training activities. Those attempts that have been made, namely by USAID and CIDA, have confirmed the difficulty of doing such evaluations.

1.4 Any evaluation of training activities requires a clarity of objectives and of expected outcomes. The objectives set out in the 1984 Plan were open-ended and not easily measurable. While EDI has made considerable efforts at systematic end-of-course evaluations, the review it did of progress of the 1984 Plan provided little evaluation of impact. Rather, it presented what was essentially a documentation of efforts made, which corresponds more closely to monitoring.

1.5 This is the first serious systematic impact evaluation effort by EDI. Because it is the first of a series of evaluations to be carried out over the next five years, an attempt was made to ensure that EDI as a whole would benefit from it. To this end, a concurrent project was undertaken by Prof. N.H. Lithwick of Carleton University in Canada to develop an impact evaluation methodology that could be replicated. The EDINU evaluation became in essence a pilot test of the applicability of the methodology, within the constraints imposed by both EDI and the conditions in SSA. Although this report describes the evaluation approach that was used, it does not go into a detailed assessment of the methodology. For this, we refer interested parties to Prof. Lithwick's report entitled **Impact Evaluation Methodology for EDI**.

Purpose of this Study

1.6 The purpose of this study, as specified in the Terms of Reference, is to determine to what extent EDI activities in Infrastructure in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) carried out from FY85-FY89 had an impact on the following objectives which it pursued:

- i. to assist policy makers and sector managers to establish improved policy and strategy frameworks for the cost-efficient supply of infrastructure services; and
- ii. to develop the capability of African partner institutions to offer programs in key aspects of infrastructure policy and sector management.

1.7 This study attempts to provide EDINU management and staff with a measure of the contribution of their various activities in meeting the above stated objectives. Beyond describing recorded impact measures, we will attempt to elucidate some of the factors, both positive and negative, that have contributed to policy and institution development processes. An understanding of these factors should help EDI articulate its future intervention strategies in order to maximize its impact.

1.8 Because the World Bank itself is a key actor in policy development and institution building in Sub-Saharan Africa, it is hoped that this report could make some contribution to the Bank's own understanding of these processes and of how it may usefully increase its cooperation with the EDI in meeting their common objectives.

CHAPTER 2

THE WORK OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT DIVISION IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA

Introduction to the general situation of Sub-Saharan Africa

2.1 The selection of Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) as the first region to be evaluated is not surprising. Africa's continuing economic crisis has presented an extraordinary challenge to the development community. Despite years of effort, the crisis has continued to deepen. During the last decade, most African countries have seen a negative growth in their economies. The World Bank, in its 1989 Long-Term Perspective Study on Sub-Saharan Africa entitled **From Crisis to Sustainable Growth**, asserts that African countries' economies must grow by at least 4 to 5 per cent a year in order to avert hunger and provide the growing population with productive jobs and rising incomes. The report suggests that an increase in productivity "requires an **enabling environment** of infrastructure services and incentives to foster efficient production and private initiative. It also requires **enhanced capacities** of people and institutions alike ". This is precisely where the EDI has hoped to make a useful contribution.

2.2 While SSA is the region with undoubtedly the greatest needs, it is also one where efforts to assist, such as those of EDI, face significant constraints. The region is heterogeneous, composed of states with artificial boundaries imposed by their colonizers. Policy environments differ from one country to the next, are usually volatile and supported by a weak institutional base. There are few regional institutions and national training institutions constantly struggle to survive.

Concerns of Infrastructure and Urban Development in SSA

2.3 The concerns of both the Bank and the EDI in Infrastructure and Urban Development have been twofold:

. Assisting in the development of an enabling environment:

Roads, railroads and port operations are the lifeline for movement of both goods and people, thus key to economic development. Neglected infrastructure,

poorly maintained roads, inefficient ports and unreliable utilities has greatly increased the cost of doing business. The World Bank and EDI have suggested that governments should give priority to rehabilitation of infrastructure over investing in new facilities. Costs could be reduced by using small contractors and revenues could be increased by raising charges. Finally, reforms in parastatals management could yield significant improvements quickly.

. Building capacity:

"Africa needs not just less government but better government -government that concentrates its efforts less on direct interventions and more on enabling others to be productive" (**From Crisis to Sustainable Growth**, p. 5). The emphasis there has been on strengthening the policy analysis and economic management capabilities of governments but also on giving autonomy to public enterprises. Local governments could play a greater role if allowed more autonomy and regular, independent sources of revenue. Stronger local governments could be an alternative to large inefficient bureaucracy and could constitute a basis for democratization.

2.4 African governments recognize the importance of infrastructure. All parties concerned grapple with the issues of developing viable policy alternatives for their countries, of allocation of limited resources to infrastructure and of developing the capacity to implement policy reforms. EDINU works to assist governments in precisely those areas.

EDINU 's Work in SSA: General Approaches

2.5 EDINU activities in SSA from FY 1985-FY 1989 support EDI's strategic objectives and use a variety of "instruments" proposed in the 1984 Plan. Direct training seminars in the area of **policy development** have included:

Senior Policy Seminars (SPS) which bring together senior policy makers to discuss policy issues and explore policy alternatives. They provide fora for dialogue where such fora don't normally exist.

Economic and Sector Management Seminars (ESM) provide direct training to high and mid level cadres in sector specific management approaches.

Table 1

Target Population - EDI Activities in Infrastructure

SPS	<u>Elected officials:</u>	Political Level:
	. Ministers/Secretaries	. Make policy decisions
	. Permanent Secretaries	. influence policy
	. Mayors (urban)	

	<u>-Senior technocrats:</u>	Bureaucracy:
	. Permanent secretaries	
	. Deputy and Under Secretaries	. influence policy
	. Directors (Transport and Urban)	
	Government Ministries	
	. General Managers/Directeur Général	
	(parastatals in transport)	
	. Town Clerk (Urban - Zimbabwe)	
ESM	<u>Senior Technocrats (water):</u>	. influence policy
	. Director (sector Ministry)	
	. Directeur général (Parastatal)	
	<u>High and Middle level technocrats:</u>	. influence policy
	(Transport and Urban):	. implement policy
	. Deputy Directors	
	. Directors of services	
	. Secrétaire général (urban)	
	. Receveur municipal (urban)	
	. Division chiefs : Finance and	
	Sector Ministries	
	. Planners and technical advisors	
	. Engineers (water)	. implement policy
TOT	. Full-time trainers and directors of	
	Institutes	
	. Technocrats who teach part-time in	
	sector Ministries or Training Institutes	

2.6 Target groups reached in both types of seminars play different roles in policy making. SPSs reach those who make or influence policies. ESMs typically reach those who may have some influence on policy formulation but whose main role is to implement policies that have been adopted. Table 1 outlines the target groups of each type of activity in relation to their role in policy development and implementation processes.

2.7 The means available to EDI to **strengthen institutions** have included:

- . **Seminars for the training of trainers (ToT)** which have brought together both full and part-time trainers who could be expected to replicate training activities. Part-time trainers are usually mid-level government bureaucrats who also play a role in implementing policy options introduced in ESM and SPS seminars.

- . **Collaboration with national and regional institutions** in organizing seminars, development of case studies and training materials, participation in the design and in the delivery of portions of EDI seminars. The nature and intended outcome of such collaboration has varied from one sector to another, and indeed within sectors.

- . **Technical Assistance:** two World Bank staff were seconded to ESAMI for several years.

- . **Organization of Donor Round Tables**

- . **Network building activities:** the case of the West African Trainers' Network on Urban Finance and Management

- . **Development of training materials.**

2.8 Over the period covered by this study, a number of trends are observed:

- . a move away from project management training to policy-related training
- . emphasis on regional seminars dealing with sectoral policy issues bringing together officials from countries, senior Bank Staff and other donors, academics and other experts
- . an increased emphasis on multi-agency teams from three or four countries as the core participants to seminars
- . a move to provide more and more training in Africa itself. All regional ESMs since 1986 were held in Africa, mostly in Senegal, Cote d'Ivoire and Kenya. SPSs, on the other hand, were still held in Europe with the exception of the 1989 SPSs in the Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Program (SSATP) , Road Maintenance Initiative which were held in African capitals.(Harare and Accra).

- more emphasis on development of good quality training materials in a variety of media: print, audio-visual and computer-aided.

Sector Strategies and Summary of Activities

2.9 EDINU is responsible for the activities of three sectors: Transport, Urban Development and Water. An overview and summary of all activities for SSA from FY 1985-FY 1989 has been compiled from activity and end-of-activity briefs and is included in Annex II of this report. A complete review reveals that objectives, strategies and methods, as well as country emphasis have differed radically among these sectors.

2.10 Transport has invested substantial energy in direct training programs which started with regional SPS programs on transport policy, and then brought middle-level managers into the emerging consensus to develop and implement appropriate tools (the series of SPS-ESM in 1985-88). A similar strategy was used in a series of SPS-ESMs focusing on road maintenance (SSATP) with emphasis on SSA countries which including Zimbabwe and Ghana to date. Transport has conducted no Training of Trainer programs. It has concentrated its institution building activities on ESAMI through provision of technical assistance, collaboration on activities, provision of training materials and pedagogical assistance, encouraging interest and support from other parts of the World Bank, organization of a donor's conference, encouraging collaboration by bilateral agencies (CDG for policy action planning) , networking with NITT and ESACC , and on collaboration including pedagogical assistance with NITT and the AfdB. Transport has had the greatest number of activities of all three sectors having been active since 1985 and has had a wide geographical coverage in SSA with a slightly greater coverage in anglophone Africa.

2.11 The Urban Sector has adopted an entirely different strategy, starting in 1987, in cooperation with UNCHS, with a series of ESMs on Urban Finance and Management and only much later holding a series of SPSs to deal with Strengthening of Local Governments. Recognizing the very modest human resource and financial capacity of EDI, the urban sector has relied on the multiplier effect and adopted a distinct institution building strategy. Four Training of Trainers seminars were held during the period with the aim of developing training materials on urban finance and management that could be disseminated. These were attended both by full-time trainers and by "users", government officials. Institutional collaboration has been stressed, culminating with an attempt at building a West African Network of Trainers. A majority of activities were held for francophone West Africa although anglophone countries were also included in 1988 and 1989.

2.12 Finally, the **Water sector** has emphasized delivery of ESMs on Rural Water and Sanitation mostly to engineers and mid-level cadres since 1987. A 1989 ESM stressed the Setting of Tariffs and brought together higher level officials. No SPSs were held during the period covered by the evaluation. Thus, there was little activity in the area of policy development. The major initiative in the institution building area has been the development of a series of audio-visual modules on Rural Water Supply and Sanitation. The Water sector which is essentially covered by one staff only has had the fewest number of activities and participants of all three sectors and has had widespread geographical coverage.

2.13 The difference among sectors in strategies and approaches reflect to a certain extent different levels of policy sophistication and institution development faced by each sector in SSA. But they have mostly evolved as EDINU staff have tended to seize opportunities as they arise and have shown great creativity in attempting to meet needs from a modest and restricted set of instruments and financial means. This variety of approaches can provide a rich opportunity for learning from each sector's experience. From an evaluation standpoint however, the consequence is that the evaluation approach must be tailored to meet the unique circumstances of each sector.

CHAPTER 3

THE EVALUATION APPROACH

General approach

3.1 The rationale behind the general approach to this evaluation was developed by Professor Lithwick and is described in the document entitled **Impact Evaluation Methodology for EDI with application to the work of the Infrastructure and Urban Development Division in Sub-Saharan Africa**. This report does not describe the rationale nor does it deal extensively with the many methodological issues encountered in the process. For this, we refer interested parties to Prof. Lithwick's study. Rather, we will describe the approach that was used in carrying out the present evaluation. We will conclude this chapter with brief observations on the validity and limits of the approach, and on the reliability of the data that emanated from such an approach.

3.2 An impact evaluation of training seeks to compare expected outcomes with actual outcomes. EDI strategic goals guiding sector and regional activities were open-ended and not outcome-oriented, making it difficult to identify measurable outcomes common to all sectors. However, from reading sectoral activity reports for the period, it was possible to establish what some expected outcomes were, and based on these, define a set of performance indicators that were clearly understood, and where possible, measurable. A comprehensive list of indicators compiled for each sector can be found in Appendix III.

3.3 Focusing on impact on the policy makers/managers themselves and on their actions could, in a sense, provide the only direct product of EDI's efforts. However, because EDI is concerned with policy outcomes, the evaluation must also assess the importance of other contributing factors, both positive and negative, in the process of policy development. They include:

- . institutional circumstances: support from superiors, institutional capacity (human and material) to implement
- . the policy environment in a given country
- . World Bank and other donor presence and conditionalities
- . crucial interaction effects: critical mass within and across ministries and agencies
- . others which the evaluation sought to identify.

3.4 Measuring EDI's contributions to institutional development is particularly difficult. The institutional base is extremely fragile in SSA. Moreover, few comprehensive needs assessments have been undertaken which could have provided a clear understanding of possible outcomes of EDI interventions within given training institutions. Expected outcomes of EDI institution building activities during the period have been identified from interviews with sector officers and from activity reports. Indicators are also included in Appendix III.

Target selection

3.5 The survey target for seminars (SPS, ESM and ToT) included:

- . the participants themselves
- . their supervisors
- . third parties who could validate information obtained from the above such as officials from Central agencies of African governments, senior World Bank officials in the field and in Washington and senior officials in cooperating donor agencies (UNCHS, RHUDO/USAID, IDRC, CIDA)

3.6 The survey target for institution-building activities included:

- . Institution directors
- . Staff who collaborated with EDINU in the activity(ies)
- . Officials from cooperating donor agencies
- . Participants in seminars delivered by the institutions

Survey modes and instruments

3.7 The most appropriate mode for this type of survey was found to be the personal interview, particularly since impacts remained somewhat imprecise. In-depth and open-ended interviewing alone could probe below the level of superficial observations. Given the large number of SSA countries that were targeted over the period, use of questionnaires could have provided for wider coverage across countries. However, the varied and imprecise nature of expected outcomes of EDI activities over the period, combined with general low response rates to mailed questionnaires observed in SSA mitigated against the use of this instrument as the main survey mode. Interview technique was adopted as the main survey mode, based on a stratified sample of visited countries (see para 3.12).

3.8 Data on policy development impacts were obtained mostly through open-ended interviews based on a set of guidelines, with key questions identified. Personal interviews were preferred over group interviews because they could ensure the participants a higher degree of confidentiality and thus, were thought to be more productive. Group interviews were limited to two or three individuals and were not to include individuals of different hierarchical levels. Letters were sent to participants prior to the interviews. Copies of letters and Guidelines for Interviews of participants, their supervisors, Senior Officials in Central Agencies and World Bank Resident Mission Representatives are included in Appendix IV.

3.9 Despite the decision not to employ mailed questionnaire as the main survey mode, an attempt was made to broaden representation and to test our assumptions about the usefulness of questionnaires in SSA. Given that course and seminar activities were not homogeneous, ESM seminars in Transport were chosen as the most appropriate sector for this experiment. A copy of the questionnaire used is included in Appendix IX.

3.10 Data on institution-building impacts were also obtained through open-ended interviews based on previously prepared guidelines. Personal interviews were carried out with Directors and collaborating staff of Training Institutions, participants of the Network as well as officials from donor agencies. Some group interviews were carried out with staff of collaborating institutions, where group synergy could yield additional insights. Copies of letters and Guidelines for Interviews are included in Appendix V.

Sample Selection

3.11 A total of 633 participants from some 41 countries in SSA were served by the training efforts of EDINU from FY 1985 to FY 1989. These countries show great diversity. However, Terms of Reference for the evaluation specified that only three or four could be visited. A representative sample of seminar participants had to be chosen, ensuring maximum coverage for each sector, and adequate representation for each type of activity. Since a major part of the evaluation focused on institution building, which also required personal interviews, the countries selected had to have a representative sample of institutions for each sector.

3.12 Discussions with sector staff suggested that major differentiating characteristics were the degree of supportiveness of the policy environment, as well as language. Thus,

countries to be visited had to include at least one with a strongly supportive policy environment and one with a neutral or non-supportive one. Similarly, both Francophone and Anglophone countries had to be represented. Four countries were chosen as the ones that would be visited: Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Senegal and Zimbabwe. An assessment of the policy environment and of sectoral policy issues in each country was compiled from World Bank country sector reports and is included in Annex VI.

3.13 The list of four countries provides us with the maximum number of participants in each type of activity and for each sector, and maximized the overlap between SPS and ESM in each sector (excluding Water) and the overlap between ToTs in at least two countries. It should be noted that this selection of countries did not include ToT activities for Water in the sample.

3.14 The sample within countries to be visited included interviews with all seminar participants, their supervisors (who in many cases were former SPS participants), Resident Mission Representatives and officials from Central agencies. Questionnaires were sent to ESM Transport participants from all SSA countries that were not visited (n= 94 participants from 24 countries).

3.15 The limited number of institutions in the 4 designated countries, to which ESAMI (Tanzania) was added, permitted an evaluation of all of them. Because the nature of institutions differ radically between sectors, and different models of institutional development have been followed, the evaluations tend to be in the nature of case studies based on interviews.

Representation and quality of responses

3.16 114 interviews were carried out during a five week period in February and March of 1990. All but three were men. 86 interviews involved participants in seminars and courses (SPS, ESM and ToT) from all three sectors i.e. 66.4% of the sample in selected countries. Individual interviews with those participants yielded a wealth of valuable information which was validated by their supervisors, many of whom had themselves been participants. The findings were also validated by 3 Resident Mission Representatives out of four who were interviewed. The degree of confidence in that data is therefore extremely high.

Table 2

Interview Distribution for

Selected Countries

Country	Participants			Institutions			Resident Representatives	Total
	Transport	Urban	Water	Transport	Urban	Water		
Côte d'Ivoire	3	12	1	AfDB/TC (4)	CRAU (2) ENA (1) RHUDD/ USAID (1)			23
Ghana	23	4	1				1	29
Senegal	2	15	4		EAU (3)	UADE (1)	1	26
Zimbabwe	11	8	2	ESAMI (1)		University of Zimbabwe (3)	1	26
Tanzania				ESAMI (9)				9
Nairobi/Kenya					UNCHS (1)			1
	38	39	8	2 inst.	5 inst.	2 inst.	3	
	86 participants			9 institutions (25 interviews)			3 resident reps.	114

Table 3

IMPACT OF ACTIVITIES ON POLICY

TOTAL POPULATION SURVEYED BY
SECTOR AND TYPE OF ACTIVITY

COUNTRY OF PARTICIPANTS	TRANSPORT		URBAN			WATER		TOTAL
	SPS	ESM	SPS	ESM	TOT	ESM	TOT	
INTERVIEWS								
Côte d'Ivoire	1	2	2	3	7	1		16
Ghana	18	5	1	2	1	1		28
Senegal	2	--	5	4	6	4		21
Zimbabwe	7	4	4	--	4	2		21
SUB TOTAL	28	11	12	9	18	8		86
QUESTIONNAIRES								
Congo		1						
Gambia		1						
Lesotho		1						
Liberia		1						
Mali		1						
Mauritania		1						
Mauritius		1						
Niger		2						
Nigeria		2						
Rwanda		1						
Senegal		2						
Sudan		1						
Tanzania		1						
Zaire		1						
Zambia		1						
SUB TOTAL		18						18
TOTAL SURVEYED								
- by type of activity	28	29	12	9	18	8	--	104
- by sub sector		57		39		8		
TOTAL POPULATION								
- by type of activity	240	109	60	58	94	60	12	633
- by sub sector		349		212		72		
% OF TOTAL POPULATION SURVEYED								
- by type of activity	11.3	25.7	20	15.5	19	13.3	--	16.4%
- by sub sector		16.1%		18.4%		11.1%		

3.17 Similarly, all institutions (n=9) were visited. A total of 25 collaborating staff, Directors of Institutes and officials from donor agencies were interviewed. Information obtained was cross-checked and validated, providing us with a high degree of confidence in the data as far as those institutions are concerned.

3.18 Finally, 18 questionnaires were received from ESM-Transport participants from 15 countries (approximately 20% of the total number of questionnaires mailed), bringing the total responses for ESM-Transport to 25.7% of the total population. Responses to questionnaires provided us with quantitative data supporting our analysis of trends observed throughout the interviews, thereby increasing the confidence in our findings.

3.19 The approach has yielded reliable data on the processes of policy and institution-building, based on a number of case studies in SSA. But the relatively low proportion of population surveyed by type of sector and type of activity (ranging from 11% to 25.7%) is such that we cannot claim the findings to be representative across all countries. A complete breakdown of the total population surveyed by sector and by type of activity can be found in Appendix VII.

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS - IMPACTS ON POLICY

4.1 One of the objectives of the evaluation was to establish the impact of EDINU activities on policy making and implementation. This Chapter summarizes examples of lasting impacts on SPS, ESM and some ToT (technocrats/users who teach part-time) participants' knowledge and skills, as well as actions carried out by them when they returned to work. Impacts of participants' actions on policy management, processes and outcomes are also reported. A review of EDINU contributions to observed policy outcomes follows, as well as a summary of factors in the environment influencing those outcomes. The Chapter concludes with participants' suggestions for improving EDINU's impact in the policy domain. A detailed account of recorded impacts by sector and country is included in Annex VIII.

Impact of SPS

4.2 Participants generally reported a **better understanding of sector policy issues in their country** following Senior Policy Seminars. This was particularly true in the Transport Sector where participants from Finance reported a better understanding of the importance of road maintenance as an investment and participants from sector ministries reported a better understanding of the broader political and financial constraints faced by their colleagues in Finance and Economic Planning. This was the case in Zimbabwe and in Ghana where both parties reported that a continuing and more open dialogue was replacing the traditional tug-of-war negotiations as a result of this increased understanding.

4.3 A number of participants reported a **better understanding of World Bank sector policy positions**. It helped some of them to come to terms with those policies in their country. On the other hand, one participant reported that his increased understanding of the logic underlying World Bank policy on urban housing stimulated creativity in developing alternative self-help housing schemes in Zimbabwe. In both cases, participants reported a renewed sense of confidence in pursuing their ideas at the policy level when they returned to their positions.

4.4 Personal contacts established between country team participants who had never met on an informal basis were reported. For example, informal contacts established between the Directeur des Collectivités Locales and a senior official from a Local Government in Senegal, and those established by three officials from the Ministry of Roads and Highways and the Director of Budgets in Ghana were reported to be ongoing and productive. These personal contacts were said to be favorable for ongoing policy dialogue and to accelerate decision-making by bypassing an otherwise lengthy bureaucratic process. **Ongoing contacts with donor agencies resulting in funding** were also reported as a lasting impact of SPS activities.

4.5 Actions carried out by SPS participants when they returned to work were varied depending on their position and the policy environment:

- . For example, a senior Finance representative recommended that the Road Maintenance budget be increased following the SPS under the SSATP initiative in Harare. The budget was in the process of being finalized and the policy environment was favorable. Thus, the road maintenance budget increased from \$ZIM 32 million to 60 million, with a parallel increase in the road construction budget from \$ZIM 64 to 90 million. The SPS was reported by a number of participants to have been instrumental but not seminal to obtaining this increase in the maintenance budget (see contributing factors, para.4.14).

- . country team participants from the Ghana Ministry of Roads and Highways from the SSATP initiative SPS on Road Maintenance formed a planning committee to fine tune their action plan and consulted other agencies and stakeholders in the process

- . Presentations were made by local government elected or senior officials to policy-making or policy influencing fora, using World Bank documents to give credibility to their arguments: In Côte d'Ivoire, a mayor used World Bank positions in a conference of Mayors to argue for more autonomy and for the creation of a financial intermediary. Similarly, one participant from Senegal used information from the seminar (comparison with other countries and tendencies in the World) in the National Assembly to push for increased autonomy for local governments. In Zimbabwe, presentations were made by a number of participants in fora of mayors, town clerks and city treasurers on proceedings of an SPS they attended. Finally, a Director of Ports in Côte d'Ivoire used World Bank documentation provided in the seminar he attended to support his demands for increased autonomy. In fact, all participants who had made presentations reported having distributed documents of the SPS proceedings when available to support their arguments.

- . One Director in Zimbabwe who had taken part in a sub-group on institution building in Rome, set up a unit dealing with Urban Transport in his department and , in line with discussions held during the EDI seminar, obtained from the Public Service Commission that one position be a local rather than an expatriate consultant position.

. One participant who had attended a number of ESM and SPS over the last four years and was in a strategic government position had distributed his materials on Financial Analysis to his staff, recommended two of his staff for ESMs and recommended that l'ENA develop seminars on Financial Analysis along the same lines as that which is taught in EDI seminars.

. A more junior Zimbabwean participant wrote a paper on the need for coordinated and integrated planning which was transmitted to his superiors. No impact has been recorded to this date.

4.6 The most quoted **impact of SPS participant actions was the opening up of policy channels through contacts and dialogue between the various stakeholders in the policy development process** who were present in seminars. Participants repeatedly stressed the importance of dialogue between Central agencies and local governments, between sector Ministries and the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning in coming up with viable policy alternatives. Participants from countries where the policy environment was reported to have been favorable stated that the dialogue had brought parties closer together in articulating viable alternatives for their country. However, participants from countries where support for a proposed policy was not shared by key Ministries or where institutional constraints were overwhelming reported little or no progress in the policy dialogue following the seminar.

4.7 One example of apparent immediate policy impact following upon an EDI sponsored activity was the increased allocation of government funds for road maintenance in Zimbabwe. This was an impressive consequence of a seminar but was also the only example of its kind that we came across.

4.8 On the other hand, donor funding to assist in the implementation of policies was found to be one of the most important consequence of several SPSs:

. Contacts made between 3 Zimbabwe participants, an IDRC program officer and an EDI officer during the SPS on Strengthening of Local Governments in Italy resulted in formulation of a series of research proposals to be integrated into a Multi-donor funded Municipal Development Program and IDRC funding of \$700,000 to establish a Local Government Network which is to include Southern Africa.

. A Minister from Ghana who had been refused support from the World Bank for rehabilitation of a rail line, made contacts with Italian Aid during one of the Transport

Round Tables in Italy and obtained \$40,000,000 to carry it out. We could establish what impacts, positive or negative, had occurred as a result of this decision.

. Contacts between SPS participants from Senegal and the Ivory Coast with RHUDO/USAID have been reinforced and have resulted in a substantial and integrated program for strengthening the capacity of local governments.

Impact of ESM (and ToT)

4.9 A majority of participants in the Urban and Transport sectors reported **upgraded skills in financial analysis and said that they now use economic analysis in decision making**. Examples were provided by participants from Côte d'Ivoire and Senegal who demonstrated their use of ratios and graphs to analyze income and expenditures as tools to counsel mayors and in courses they give in their agencies or in Institutions. 11 of the 18 participants who responded to the ESM questionnaire reported improved ability in transport planning. Three participants reported increased knowledge of human resource management practices, in particular of recruitment practices and performance contracts.

4.10 While some ESM participants in the Water sector reported having acquired new knowledge and skills, these were not in the policy domain. Participants with a technical background and position (engineers mostly) reported having acquired new insights into Water and Sanitation technology. One provincial administrator reported having upgraded his skills in planning. Participants in planning or policy influencing positions in Central governments or parastatals reported interest but no real impact.

4.11 **Contacts made by individuals with donors**, particularly in the Urban sector, led to more training opportunities for various individuals either in the form of on-the-job follow-up support, provision of computer equipment or a study tour financed for one ESM participant and his supervisor (an SPS participant) in Senegal.

4.12 As is the case for SPSs, **actions** undertaken by ESM participants varied:

. most individuals surveyed through questionnaires and interviews reported having written a report for their supervisors. Few had actually distributed the materials although roughly 40 % claimed to refer to the documentation as needed. Bureaucrats who teach in training institutes used comparative data, figures and graphs as supporting documentation in courses they developed.

. two individuals who had attended an ESM on Transport Planning undertook to formulate a corporate plan: one in National Railways of Zimbabwe with World Bank support, and one in the context of the 4th Highway project in Ghana.

. Two participants from Ghana involved in the Urban II project in Ghana applied new ways of budgeting: they went from a national budgeting format to a program/project oriented format. They also formed a task force to monitor revenue collection of untapped resources (hotels and other businesses) . They increased revenue by 50% (Jan. '90 vs. Jan.'89) from that source alone.

. Three participants (from Zimbabwe Ministry of Transport, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana parastatals) reported having implemented changes in recruitment practices in their organizations, making use of terms of reference, position descriptions, and selection pannels to replace arbitrary practices.

. An inter-ministerial country team who had attended an ESM on urban finance and management got together to proceed with their action plan to reform the municipal tax collection system of the informal sector in Dakar with the mayor's support and institutional support from USAID. They surveyed the markets and issued permits, and instituted computerized data collection. The project is ongoing but the impact is impossible to estimate as all have moved to other positions.

. A similar project was undertaken by a Secrétaire Général de Mairie in Côte d'Ivoire despite his mayor's opposition. The pilot phase of the project yielded a projected yearly net increase of CFA 117,057,600 for the municipality but was stopped due to political pressure.

. In the Water sector, one provincial administrator in Ghana developed materials on project planning and one lecturer modified part of a course he teaches at Kumasi University to 4th year engineering students to include a module on community participation. No other actions were undertaken in the policy management domain by ESM participants in Water.

4.13 The impacts of ESMs in terms of an increase in efficiency and performance of their organization or municipality are difficult to establish. While the evidence shows that participants have tended to apply their acquired skills when they were in a position to do so , any increase in performance or efficiency of their organization has not been perceived by Central agencies as the direct consequence of their attending an EDI seminar. For example, a senior official in the Ministry of the Interior of Côte d'Ivoire reported no noticable improvement in performance in local governments as a result of EDI seminars. Moreover, he suggested that the presence of more important donor agencies namely the World Bank and USAID (in the urban sector) who provide training and support in-

country would make a direct link between EDI activities and any increase in overall organizational performance difficult to evaluate.

EDINU Contributions to Policy Outcomes

4.14 Participants identified a number of factors that had either made a positive contribution to observed impacts or had been constraints in their accomplishment. Some of these factors stemmed from EDI seminars themselves and other were outside of EDI's control. When asked what in particular they had found most useful from the EDI seminars when they returned to their work positions, participants of both SPSs and ESMs resported the following:

i. In the realm of process:

. By adopting a country team approach, EDI seminars create fora for formal and informal dialogue between key stakeholders in policy formulation in countries where none previously exist. The bringing together of key individuals from Finance and the Ministry of Transport in the 1989 SPS in Harare was seen to have been instrumental in influencing the government to allocate more funds to road maintenance. Presence of a critical mass of participants from the Ministry of Transport and its agencies in Ghana in developing an action plan in the Ghana SPS was seen to have been instrumental in their Ministry adopting an integrated plan with increased participation of their agencies. Similarly, some SPS and ESM country teams pursued their action plans (the case of Senegal) or got together to pursue their research in policy alternatives (in Zimbabwe).

. Exchange with other African countries and with experts, particularly Africans: this allowed participants to bounce off their ideas and to get reactions to them, it helped them to see their own situation when compared with others stimulating them to emulate countries better than theirs and to invest in prevention where other countries had faced negative consequences as a result of inappropriate policies. Either way, participants reported an increase in confidence in their ideas and renewed energy to pursue articulation of policy and management alternatives in their country as a result of this interaction.

. Exchange with the World Bank and other Donors: EDI seminars bring together key external players in policy development in African countries. Exposure to the rationale behind World Bank policies resulted in a greater understanding of those policies, leading in some cases to increased support and

in others, to generation by participants of policy alternatives seen to be more appropriate to their country.

ii. in the realm of content:

. Information, facts and figures, for example on the life span of roads and on the cost of not maintaining them, on municipal tax collection systems and on water and sanitation technology used in other African countries were found to be beneficial by all levels of participants.

. Specific management skills and approaches introduced in ESM seminars particularly in the areas of financial analysis, budget preparation and planning were reported as beneficial. This was stressed by ESM participants in the Urban Sector in West Africa who reported that most municipal administrators had been trained in either public or private administration and had not been exposed to municipal finance and management prior to attending the ESMs. Similarly, ESMs in Transport Planning filled a void in that area at the time.

. Materials, particularly summaries of deliberations of SPSs, when available in a timely fashion, were seen to have been instrumental in convincing superiors and various interest groups of policy options. These materials were seen to add credibility to what otherwise could be seen as narrow self-interest on the part of sector ministries or local governments. Participants who had not received these materials deplored this fact, stressing their importance in furthering the dialogue in-country.

Factors in the Environment Influencing Outcomes on Policy

4.15 EDINU activities in SSA over the last five years have not been held in isolation. Participants, their supervisors, officials from Central agencies and World Bank Resident Mission Representatives consistently identified a number of factors in their environment that had facilitated or impeded application of ideas and skills treated in EDI seminars:

. Personalities ready to work with change and in a position to adopt, influence or sustain policy changes. Personalities play an important role in African policy processes. The development of a critical mass of such personalities and the contacts established either through one seminar or over a number of seminars in a given period of time were seen to be conducive to actions which create impact. Examples of senior government officials

in the Urban sectors in Senegal and in Zimbabwe who have continued to pursue policy changes in the strengthening of local governments support this observation. Conversely, participants not in a position to adopt or influence policy changes reported frustration and little observable impact beyond their increased knowledge.

. **A favorable policy environment in a given country.** Support from the political level in-country and internal political pressures within the country were seen to be critical. Participants reported that seminars had more impact when they reinforced ideas that their government already espoused (eg. importance that roads be maintained or decentralization of responsibility for infrastructure to local governments) and/or that were supportive of positions held by policy-influencing interest groups (eg. fora of mayors pushing for increased devolution of authority at the local government level). Conversely, policy options politically not acceptable to a country (eg. charging for water in the countryside) had little chance of being implemented unless alternatives that met political needs were identified.

. **Although World Bank presence and projects as well as conditionalities attached to loans** were seen to be constraining by many participants, it was also clear that they contribute to a policy environment favorable to application of ideas raised in EDI seminars, particularly when combined with specific political incentives to apply in a country. For example, the increased budget to road maintenance in Zimbabwe following the SPS in Harare was strongly supported by follow-up contacts of a World Bank officer negotiating a loan with the government. The timing was also conducive as budgets were being struck at the time of the seminar and the increase in budget for roads was politically attractive in an election year.

. **Institutional capacity to implement.** Given political support to implement policies SPSs suggested that availability of technical know-how to implement and of financial and human resources to do it were critical. Where institutional capacity-building efforts were undertaken following EDI seminars, participants were more optimistic about possible sustainable impacts. Participants cited examples of support through World Bank projects (Developing planning capacity in National Railways of Zimbabwe and in Ghana Roads and Highways, training and technical assistance provided in Urban projects in Senegal, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana to cite a few). Efforts by other donors such as RHUDO/USAID programs to strengthen capacities of local governments in West Africa were also mentioned. Where implementation of policies ran up against institutional constraints such as lack of skills to implement, lack of coordination with other ministries, lengthy bureaucratic recruitment process and non-competitive salary structures, lack of functioning equipment (to maintain roads, for example) or computers (to analyze data in urban, for example), participants were less optimistic that significant impacts would be found or sustained.

Participant Suggestions made for Improvement of EDI Impact on Policy

4.16 When asked how EDI could increase its contribution to policy processes and their ultimate outcomes, participants were unanimous in identifying key areas where they felt EDINU could improve its impact:

. More focussed seminars either in terms of content or target audience (number of countries and levels of participants). Broad topic seminars (eg. Transport Policy or Rural Water and Sanitation) were found to cover a wide range of issues on a superficial level without being able to answer specific policy concerns affecting, for example, Ports in Côte D'Ivoire, beyond a very rhetorical level. Seminars that would be focussed on more specific topics (eg. road maintenance, issues in urban transportation or municipal resource mobilization through improvements in the collection of municipal fees) were thought to be more conducive to in-depth treatment and generation of concrete and applicable proposals. Seminars bringing together a large number of countries at different levels of development and with different policy environments were interesting but again, could not go concretely into specific policy alternatives applicable to given countries. Participants suggested that focussing seminars on fewer countries facing similar policy and sector management issues may have been more fruitful (eg. Kenya and Zimbabwe in the area of Transport). Finally, seminars bringing together groups of people with very different concerns (eg. engineers with planners in the Water sector) diluted the content, thereby reducing the possible impact.

. Include political levels in the process. Participants of both SPSs and ESMs were unanimous in their suggestions that political decision-making levels be included at some point in EDI activities so as to secure political support for proposed policy and management reforms. However, the majority of participants suggested that EDI should not mix levels throughout the training activities. On the one hand, presence of the Minister or of a Mayor was thought to stifle open discussion among participants. On the other hand, policy makers such as Ministers reported that they did not have the time to attend lengthy seminars and thought they were better targeted to their senior government bureaucrats and advisors. Participants agreed on a number of solutions to the dilemma which ranged from inviting Ministers to the last day of the deliberations (the two-tier approach) or holding focussed short conferences for Ministers and Mayors on topics covered in seminars, to EDI following-up through mail or personal contacts with individual Ministers or Mayors.

. Participants suggested that EDI could increase its impact by **relying more on African resources, holding all seminars in African countries** including SPSs, and including **more field trips**. These were part of a generally expressed concern that policy discussions be held close to their realities.

. **Follow-up of regional seminars with national actions.** Participants reported that policy discussions in regional seminars remained at a rhetorical level and could not deal in much depth with any national policy concerns. Regional seminars limit the numbers of participants from given countries and key actors are often missing. Participants suggested that seminars bringing together all key actors in a given sector, analyzing in-depth policy concerns of that country, associating World Bank operations and coming up with a concrete action plan may improve impact on policy substantially. A viable alternative two-tier approach, such as the one used in one of the SSATP Road Maintenance Initiative seminar where a plenary session was followed up by country specific modules on policy action planning, was found to be effective

. **Follow-up on country action plans.** Participants suggested that impact could have been increased had EDI followed up on progress of action plans with them and with their ministries a year or two following the seminars. The mere act of EDI following up was seen to potentially create additional incentive to implement the action plans. Participants suggested that taking stock of progress in-country could lead to more focussed EDI or World Bank interventions to deal with political or institutional capacity barriers that have come up in the policy reform process. This impact evaluation was cited as a step in the right direction.

. **Other follow-up actions were suggested.** Sharing of experiences through an alumni bulletin and a follow-up conference either on a national or regional level were seen to be potential factors in keeping initiatives progressing. Other forms of support such as the funding of exchanges between participants were suggested as necessary to pursue the quest for appropriate policy alternatives and management improvements. Interest in such an exchange between SPS participants from Ghana and Zimbabwe was raised by an ESAMI rapporteur of Ghanaian origin who had attended Senior Seminars under the SSATP Road Maintenance Initiative in Accra and in Harare. He suggested that Ghana could learn from Zimbabwe's experience in regulation of axle loads, and that Zimbabwe could learn from Ghana's experience in road user funds. While we did not establish who had funded the actual exchange which occurred a few months after the seminar, participants reported that it had led to articulation of concrete solutions to issues they faced in their jobs.

CHAPTER 5

FINDINGS - IMPACT ON INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY BUILDING

5.1 One of EDINU's objective was "to develop capability of African partner institutions to offer programs in key aspects of infrastructure policy and sector management" (para.1.6) This study seeks to identify to what extent EDI activities have led to increasing African institutional capacity to analyze needs, design materials, carry out modest applied research, use/modify EDI materials and ultimately design their own materials reflecting a closer link to their client base, develop a consulting function, and market their courses and services more effectively. Multiple approaches were used by EDINU in SSA. Findings are reported for each type of approach.

Impact of ToT on Institutional Capacity-Building

5.2 The majority of dedicated ToT activities were carried out by the Urban sector with the exception of one ToT in the Water sector. Given that there were no participants of ToT -Water in visited countries, impact of this activity could not be assessed. Of the 18 participants to Urban sector ToTs which were interviewed, 7 were dedicated trainers, 4 were directors of training institutes or departments in the institutes, and 8 were "users" i.e. bureaucrats who were also part-time trainers in national training institutions such as l'ENA and CRAU in West Africa. Responses from two participants who had attended ESMs (one in Transport and one in Urban) and were part-time trainers are also included in these findings.

5.3 Dedicated trainers, most of whom were in West Africa, cited the exposure to the use of computer technology for training in Urban Finance as the single most important benefit of their training sessions. However, the majority of these trainers did not report any improvement in their abilities as trainers. Although the activities were entitled "Training of Trainers", participants reported that the objective was to produce training materials in the area of Urban Finance and Management and consequently, little time was devoted to actually improving their skills as trainers. They suggested that more time should be dedicated to actual training of trainers in design of materials and in communication skills. Training of Trainers seminars of the type provided by RHUDO/USAID in West Africa were cited as useful both by participants and senior officials of Ministries of the Interior in Senegal and in Côte d'Ivoire, particularly given that they are followed-up by on-the-job and institutional support including the purchase of equipment. In fact, lack of computer equipment prevented most trainers from using

computer technology in their courses. One participant suggested that this was indeed the case for most audio-visual methods introduced in seminars delivered by donors.

5.4 In Côte d'Ivoire, a more important factor was the fact that half of those trained by EDI were not retained in the World Bank / USAID /ILO training project to strengthen local governments (trainers who had attended the USAID-funded ToTs were). It may be interesting to note that most of the trainers who had attended USAID funded ToTs were at slightly lower levels of responsibility than the EDI participants and that ultimately, in order to join the World Bank /USAID/ILO project, they had to leave their government functions. The EDI-ToT participants were pessimistic about their future and were puzzled by the apparent lack of coordination between World Bank Operations and EDINU in this project.

5.5 The two trainers who had attended ESMs in the Transport and Water sectors reported increased sectoral knowledge but no increase of their knowledge or skills as trainers.

5.6 Government bureaucrats who teach part-time either in their Ministries or in Training Institutes reported increased knowledge, particularly in the area of municipal finance management and financial analysis, parts of which were passed on in their courses. Participants from Senegal and Côte d'Ivoire reported using more visual aids such as graphs to plot evolution of tax income over time and similar graphs from World Bank documents distributed in the course. They also reported having modified their courses to disseminate the idea of fiscal responsibility . Some reported that they were planning to use the materials that will result from the ToT and be produced by EDI-UNCHS once they are made available.

5.7 The Head of Local Government studies of the Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management reported that ZIPAM would run a course (April 23-27) on Urban Finance and Management using some EDI materials distributed in a 1988 ToT in Kenya that he attended.

5.8 Finally, as was the case for SPS and ESM, some participants reported ongoing contacts with other participants in-country or with donors. For example, the Head of Local Government Studies at ZIPAM reported continued collaboration with participants on the "user" side of that course in formulating the multi-donor funded Municipal development program referred to in para. 4.7. The Director of a Municipal Training Centre in Dakar reported that contacts established with the French Cooperation Agency during a ToT she attended had led to a donation of 1,5000,000 CFA for the purchase of books.

Impact of Bilateral Collaboration with Training Institutes in SPS and ESM Activities

5.9 EDINU has collaborated with African institutions, international training institutes and donor agencies in the planning, design and delivery of one or a number of SPS and ESM activities. One type of collaboration with African institutions has been a bilateral, low-cost approach, based on foreign technical assistance: training institutions provide classrooms, logistics and a name (the partner), EDI and others provide funding, the content and resource persons. The next step up has involved African institutions in designing case studies and delivering substantive parts of given seminars, or in acting as rapporteurs. Expectations and perceived impact of collaboration with EDI on capacity-building of each institution are reported in this section. Impact of more sustained support to Regional Institutions (the case of ESAMI) and to the West African Network on Urban Finance are reported in a later section of this chapter.

5.10 Water Sector ESM activities in SSA were partially funded by EDI, marketed and delivered by CEFIGRE, a French-based training organization. The University of Zimbabwe's Department of Civil Engineering and the Union Africaine des Distributeurs d'Eau (UADE) collaborated on one ESM each. They were expected to provide the venue and to handle mostly the logistical aspects of course organization.

5.11 When asked about impact of this collaboration on their institution, staff from the University of Zimbabwe remembered the activity as having been put on by CEFIGRE as a money-raising exercise and claimed that they had advised World Bank officials in the Resident Mission that they wanted no more to do with CEFIGRE. Given that collaboration with the U. of Zimbabwe was limited to this one activity, no positive impact was reported. There was however, a great interest in collaborating with EDI particularly in light of the fact that a Training Centre in low cost Water Supply and Sanitation has been established at the University as part of the World Bank International Training Network for Water Supply and Waste Management. The Centre provides in-service training and modules including visual aids covering topics such as "The role of the community in provision and maintenance of water supply and sanitation". Staff suggested that provision of EDI audio-visual modules and of materials such as the Financial Assessment Package would make a useful contribution to their ongoing efforts to strengthen what is hoped to be a regional institution for southern Africa. Participants who had a similar opinion of CEFIGRE suggested that future courses should be held in cooperation with the U. Of Zimbabwe.

5.12 The Director of the UADE was less critical of CEFIGRE than his Zimbabwe colleagues. He stated that the activity in which his organization had collaborated was a positive first step but that in itself it did not constitute enough of a sustained effort to create an impact. He suggested that follow-up activities were required and that these could be organized without CEFIGRE. He suggested that the UADE's needs as an institution were in two areas: 1) to get senior bureaucrats from both francophone and anglophone Africa together to exchange views on policy issues and 2) to disseminate management approaches contained in three manuals developed by UADE. Discussions about future collaboration with EDINU were underway at the time of this evaluation.

5.13 Collaborative activities in the Transport Sector were undertaken with NITT, ESAMI and the African Development Bank/Training Centre (AfDB/TC). Impacts of collaborative activities with NITT were not assessed and those of ESAMI are reported in 5.18. The AfDB/TC collaborated with EDI in organizing four seminars on Transport Policy which were held in 1987 and 1988. EDI provided most of the materials and some resource persons. EDI requested that AfDB produce one or two papers, provide resource persons and a counterpart who could be trained to replicate such courses. While AfDB/TC reported that this type of collaboration with EDI had been successful in the case of training programs on Structural Adjustment, this one had failed mainly because the Centre did not have the human resources to invest in training in the transport sector. Training materials developed for those courses were in their library but were not being used by the Centre. The role of the AfDB/TC is now being reevaluated.

5.14 The Urban sector collaborated with a number of training institutions in Senegal and in Côte d'Ivoire. In all cases, EDINU expected the institutions to collaborate in developing course outlines and case studies or segments of courses relevant to the African situation, and to assist with logistical arrangements. EDINU expected that this collaboration would result in increased capability of institutions in the areas of course administration and management, and production of pedagogical materials. It was hoped that providing a platform for the institutions would increase their credibility in their region and that EDI materials would be used and replicated by them. Finally, it was hoped that some of these institutions would take on an active role in the West African Network on Urban Finance and Management. The average length of cooperation was 3 to 5 weeks.

5.15 The ENA and CRAU were visited in Abidjan and the Director and staff of the EAU were interviewed in Senegal. They described different impacts as a result of their collaboration with EDINU:

. the Centre de Recherches Architecturales et Urbaines (CRAU) prepared a number of case studies, delivered briefings, conducted field visits and handled logistics of a 1987 ToT

which was followed up by a Round Table in Abidjan. Both the Director and a staff member reported that their participation had increased the visibility and credibility of the CRAU: a ivoirien newspaper reported on their involvement in the course leading to projects with UNICEF and cooperation with USAID. Documents produced by participants and World Bank materials had also contributed to their library and are often referred to.

5.16 The CRAU stated that impact on building their capacity could have been greater. They had expected their collaboration with EDINU to result in development of knowledge and skills of one of their staff in the area of Urban Finance and Management through his participation in the activity as a trainee. They had also understood that computer equipment used in the course would remain with their institution and finally, that their performance would lead to further collaboration. Discussions of further collaboration were being held at the time of this evaluation, two years after the initial cooperation.

5.17 The **Ecole Nationale d'Administration (ENA)** reported that their participation in the 1987 ToT in Abidjan had been limited due to circumstances beyond their control. As no further collaboration had been undertaken, no impact was noted. The ENA suggested that EDINU's contribution to building their capacity should be in the areas of financial and technological support (audio-visual and computer equipment and vehicles).

5.18 The **Ecole d'Architecture et d'Urbanisme (EAU)** played a role similar to that of the CRAU in a ToT in Dakar and reported similar impacts: increased visibility, opportunity to market their services and eventually increased contacts with UNCHS. As in the case of the CRAU, they had expected more sustained collaboration. They had hoped that the EDINU would use them as the key institution to coordinate the West African Network on Urban Finance and Management. Collaboration was reported by both EDINU and EAU to have vanished after the Round Table which followed the course.

Impact of EDI and World Bank Long-Term Support and Collaboration on ESAMI's Capability in the Transport Sector

5.19 Cooperation between the World Bank and EDI with ESAMI dates back to 1977. The terms of reference of this study limited the assessment of impact to capacity-building activities in the Transport sector from 1985-89. Interviews were held with 7 members of the Transport teaching staff, a librarian and a research assistant as well as the Director. All had been involved in one or more of the collaborative activities which included:

. co-financing of a Transport Policy Round Table organized by ESAMI in 1985. Technical assistants played a major role in the planning, organization and running the Round Table. An EDINU officer reviewed ESAMI's proposal for the creation of an African Transport Management Studies Centre and made a presentation on the Francophone Round Table held in Rome.

. secondment of two World Bank officers under the SSA Technical Assistance Program for a period of three years. One of those officers later joined EDINU and pursued institution-building activities relating to ESAMI.

. EDINU organized a donor's Conference in La Hague in 1988 to seek support for ESAMI's African Transport Management Studies Centre.

. EDINU invited ESAMI staff to act as rapporteurs in SSATP initiative SPSs held in Ghana and in Zimbabwe in 1989, and suggested the use of an ESAMI resource person on the Carl Duisberg Gessellschaft Foundation team to facilitate the policy action planning portion of the SSATP Seminar in Zimbabwe.

. EDI has provided resource persons to support ESAMI courses eg. Railway Management and Policy

. EDI materials are sent to ESAMI library and staff on a regular basis.

. Consultation on EDI materials in Railroad Management and Policy leading to possible use of these materials in ESAMI courses is ongoing.

5.20 The impacts of these activities are reported below in order of importance attributed to them by the majority of those who were interviewed. **Technical assistance, at a time when it was needed**, is recognized as having had a great impact in building up ESAMI's capacity in the Transport sector. This assistance resulted in the establishment of new courses in procurement, rural transport, road safety and road maintenance, planning and management. These courses are still part of core offerings, rely on some of the original materials and have been modified by African staff recruited by ESAMI to include sections on policy. Advice provided on program development, contacts and marketing made in the region during that period were found to be particularly useful to developing ESAMI's capacity in Transport in these earlier stages. An attempt to develop a marketing catalogue to gain scholarship support from untouched donors funds died after the departure of the technical assistants.

5.21 The other notable contribution was said to be the **Hague donors' conference** which resulted in salary support for three African specialists recruited these last few years in the Transport sector. This will allow ESAMI to update existing courses and to develop new ones. This was seen to be a particularly important contribution as institutions such as ESAMI who operate on cost-recovery find it difficult to allocate resources to development of new materials or to take the time to train counterparts through technical assistance. Given tight constraints on people and money, the counterpart approach is seen as expensive duplication of effort with limited results. ESAMI's preferred option is to hire competent individuals with salary support from donors who can themselves produce materials and deliver courses. At the end of the salary support period, cost-recovery through delivery of these new or updated courses will allow these staff members to be integrated into the ESAMI payroll. A number of staff members, as well as the Director, suggested that this approach was the most appropriate at this stage in their development, as was fellowship support to undertake training of trainers activities. They suggested that these approaches were preferable to ongoing technical assistance because capabilities remained within the institution at the end of the period of assistance. However, they expressed disappointment at the fact that the anticipated salary support for three persons that the World Bank had indicated it would try to mobilize had not materialized.

5.22 Contacts made by technical assistants were found to still be useful and were said to be pursued on a systematic basis by both the marketing division of ESAMI and by individual staff members seeking consultancies in the region. Contacts established through EDINU with NITT and ESACC led to exchange of experiences and were hoped to ultimately result in "paid" consulting work with those institutions. Ongoing support through the provision of resource persons was also said to be useful in ensuring delivery of their courses. World Bank and EDI documents (mostly statistics and technical information) sent to staff were used as reference materials in parts of courses. However, staff and personnel in the library noted that the volume of materials sent to them could be reduced to those they would order from the catalogues of publications.

5.23 Overall, the assistance noted above was considered to have been instrumental in strengthening the capability of ESAMI. The Director of ESAMI noted that support in the Transport sector was "the only success story because of the sustained interest even after technical assistants left". Given the difficulties faced by Training Institutions in Africa, ESAMI's capacity in the Transport sector is indeed impressive. Staff of the newly formed Transport Training Centre are all Africans with a solid academic background. Materials prepared and modified by ESAMI staff for three Transport courses were reviewed ; they contained objectives, course outlines which included sections on policy and a good variety of training approaches including case studies, discussions and field trips. It was not possible to assess efficiency of the design in meeting the stated objectives as no courses

were being held at the time of our visit and only one participant to an ESAMI course held 3 years ago could be interviewed.

5.24 The catalogue of courses and consulting services provided by ESAMI in the transport sector contains a list of 16 courses offered on a regular basis throughout the region and outlines qualifications of their consulting staff. Statistics on numbers trained and consulting contracts carried out were not available at the time. No systematic assessment of the effectiveness of these courses and consultations (other than end-of-course evaluations) had been done in the last few years and, in any case, would not be entirely attributable to EDI interventions in capacity-building.

5.25 Despite their recognition of the positive impacts of support activities in the first part of the period, the Director and staff of ESAMI were more critical of the approaches used in the latter part of the period. While they acknowledged that their involvement in the SPSs under the SSATP initiative provided them with visibility and marketing opportunities, they suggested that limiting their role to that of "rapporteurs", and not giving them a role in the actual delivery of the seminars may actually undermine their credibility with African governments. The question posed was: "If the World Bank and EDI want Africans to use ESAMI, why not use ESAMI staff to teach some of their seminars?" They stated that they were open to a comprehensive assessment of their capacity as a training institution, and suggested that such an assessment was indeed necessary for future institution-building efforts to be appropriate and beneficial.

Impact of the Round Tables on the Establishment of a West African Network on Urban Finance and Management Training

5.26 Two Round Tables were held in 1987 and 1988 with the objective of creating a Network to strengthen the capacities of institutions and training units involved in training on urban finance and management in West Africa. Efforts in the area were numerous and uncoordinated and the various actors involved had limited means at their disposal. The creation of some kind of a structure to link efforts of these African institutions and those of bilateral and multilateral donors was thought to be necessary .

5.27 The first Round Table held in Abidjan in 1987 regrouped institutions from Côte d'Ivoire (ENA, CRAU, CIGE, and the Direction des Collectivités Locales /Ministère de l'Intérieur), EAU and ENDA from Dakar, and IIAP based in Paris. Bilateral donors were

also represented (USAID, UNCHS, Hanns Seidel Foundation from Germany, French cooperation, and IULA from The Hague). The objective of this first Round Table was to define the capacity-building strategy of a possible network and resulted in each participating institution or agency identifying their potential contributions to this endeavour.

5.28 The second Round Table held in Dakar the following year included 11 additional institutions based in either Dakar or Abidjan, as well as IDRC. The purpose of this Round Table was to exchange information on existing institutional capacity for training in Urban Finance and Management. The needs to compile information on existing programs and resources of member institutions and prepare an agenda for a third Round Table in 1989 were identified. A sub-group composed of EAU, CESAG and DCL in Senegal were to prepare a questionnaire to be sent to all participants.

5.29 Nothing has happened since. Participants who were interviewed reported they had not received a questionnaire from the sub-group. An interview with the Director of the EAU confirmed that a questionnaire had not been drawn up because collaboration with the CESAG was difficult. Institutions such as EAU and CESAG compete with each other to survive. EAU suggested that the benefits of investing their limited resources in establishing a type of secretariat for the Network were not important enough unless they were recognized and supported as a lead-institution. Furthermore, they suggested that a forum of exchange was not what was needed as they already participate in the "Réseau des Ecoles et Institutions de Formation en Urbanisme" which groups the CRAU, ENA from Morocco, etc. Rather, some kind of a coordinating mechanism was perceived as more appropriate.

5.30 The view that a coordinating centre or secretariat is necessary to provide impetus and manage the Network was shared by other Round Table participants. They suggested that such a Network could not be effectively led by a training institute because of the history of links and conflicts and that EDINU should play more of a leadership role in establishing the Network because of its institutional credibility and authority to back it up.

5.31 Again, as was the case for other collaborative activities with SSA training institutions, lack of a common understanding of objectives of the Network, of roles and responsibilities of donors on the one hand, and of African partner institutions on the other, led to frustrations on both sides: donors had expected that members of the Network would take it on after a few initial meetings, and members had expected that EDINU would actually take on the coordination and provide funding for its activities. While the implication of these findings are fairly obvious, a complete analysis and discussion of the implications for future EDINU activities are discussed in the next chapter.

CHAPTER 6

ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS AND IMPLICATIONS

Impact of EDINU Activities on Policy Innovation and Management

To what extent has EDINU succeeded in "assisting policy makers and sector managers to establish improved policy and strategy frameworks for the cost-efficient supply of infrastructure"?

6.1 Our findings suggest that EDINU has had some impact, particularly in the area of policy processes. Senior Policy Seminars have been instrumental in improving the dialogue among key players who influence and articulate policies in their countries, particularly with the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning. While this dialogue was instrumental in leading to an actual increase of budget in only one case, many examples were provided of continuing dialogue between these parties, leading to less confrontational negotiations on budget.

6.2 Inter and intra-Ministerial Task Forces have been born out of a willingness of country teams to pursue implementation of action plans. Positive examples were found in Ghana's Ministry of Roads and Highways which had pursued and broadened the consultation with their agencies to fine-tune their action plan, in Senegal where an SPS inter-ministerial country team had evolved into a Task Force to reform municipal tax collection through mobilization of informal sector taxes, and in Zimbabwe where SPS and ESM participants were collaborating in research on policy alternatives to strengthen local governments. A critical mass of participants in either an SPS, an ESM or a combination of those over time has stimulated the pursuit of this dialogue.

6.3 A greater understanding of World Bank sectoral policies and of the rationale behind them was reported by SPS participants. We could not establish whether this had resulted in less confrontational negotiations with the Bank in given countries. What we could establish however, was that this increased understanding either led participants to come to terms with some of those policies or stimulated them to formulate alternatives.

6.4 A better understanding of World Bank policies and of their application (or lack of) in other African countries has provided an opportunity for participants to confront their

own ideas with a resulting increase in confidence in their positions on policy. Various interest groups influence policy discussions within a country. Materials documenting World Bank facts and figures and "Points of consensus on policy issues" agreed to by many African countries in the context of SPSs have been used by some SPS participants in pursuing the dialogue on sectoral and decentralization policies to support their push for reforms. This has not yet resulted in tangible policy reforms but was reported as having contributed to parties progressing towards agreement on some policy alternatives (this is most evident in mayors' fora demanding increased autonomy).

6.5 While regional, broad topic SPSs facilitate exchanges between a number of countries on global sectoral policy issues (eg. Transport Policy in SSA), they limit in-depth discussion of policy issues and options applicable to given countries. Discussions rarely go beyond the rhetorical level and have rarely been followed up with concrete action beyond the continuation of the debate on general principles. Participants suggested that the problem they face is often not that they are not convinced of a general policy option (eg. most African governments are in theory committed to strengthening local governments or to maintaining their roads) but that "no one will sit down with them to help them define policy alternatives that are politically acceptable and economically realistic in their countries, and with modalities of implementation". For example, could a seminar not explore alternatives to totally lifting the "tutelle" imposed on local governments in Senegal, discuss criteria and implications of the choices open to them? The World Bank is a key actor in influencing policy but ultimately policies are decided on a national level. Focused seminars in-country with key stakeholders participating, followed by World Bank or donor support to implement (eg. SSATP senior seminars) have produced encouraging results.

6.6 Once policy alternatives have been developed, SSA governments need the institutional capacity to implement. Training provided in EDINU's ESMs has made a contribution to developing this capacity. ESM participants reported an increased understanding of policy issues and improved skills, particularly in the areas of financial planning (municipalities) and corporate planning (of parastatals), and human resource management, in particular recruitment. Participants related their many attempts at applying their newly acquired skills. But as we outlined in Table 1, ESM participants implement policies but have little influence on changing them. Successful application of the skills acquired has depended on whether they had support from their superiors and from the political level, and whether the institutional constraints (absence of computer and equipment, complex bureaucratic procedures, etc.) could be overcome. Thus, training on "how to" should be consistent with policies in place if impact is sought.

6.7 Those who have been prevented from implementing their action plans or cannot use their skills because of the policy environment in their countries continue to disseminate

formally and informally the concepts (eg. of fiscal responsibility) they acquired in the courses (particularly true in West Africa). Some of them suggested that EDINU should take a long term historical view of impact and have faith that educating more and more people in these concepts will eventually produce results. Others more in a hurry to see results, suggested that EDINU should integrate in its strategy intervention at the political level in order to secure political support to apply participants' skills. SPS participants also stressed the importance of support at the political level for policy options to which they are committed.

6.8 Different strategies have been adopted by EDI to ensure this critical interaction between the policy-making levels, and the policy-influencing and implementing levels of government bureaucrats. Political levels and senior bureaucrats have been brought together in SPSs with mixed results. Mobility at the political levels (Ministers change at least every 3 years) precludes any sustained political support for policy options within a Ministry. Sector Ministers should be reached every three years. As policy reform is a long-term process, Ministers have suggested that the key target population for SPSs ought to be the very senior level of bureaucrats on whom they rely for policy advice (Deputy Secretaries and Directors) and who are much more stable. Moreover, they stated that demands of their Office were such that they could not easily afford the time required of SPSs. The levels of senior bureaucrats who participated in SPSs tended to agree with this view and furthermore, suggested that discussions of alternatives with Ministers present tended to stultify the debate. All parties agreed that political levels should be reached to gain support for options put forward by their senior advisors and suggested that a strategy much like the Two-Tier approach used by EDI in Asia be adopted.

6.9 Preceding ESMs by SPSs (in Transport) or following ESMs by SPSs (in Urban) has been another strategy to create this interaction between political and policy-influencing levels (SPS) and implementing levels (EMSs) of the bureaucracy. Either way, this approach has created over time a certain critical mass within Ministries (eg. in Senegal's Ministry of the Interior) providing them with support at different levels, thereby facilitating introduction of new ideas. Whether an SPS or ESM is required at a given point in the policy development process depends on an analysis of the strategic target of intervention at each stage so that the process may evolve. EDI may not have the resources to do such an analysis but could liaise with other departments in the Bank to gauge where interventions have a chance of resulting in impact. Nevertheless, political support is required for ESM participants to enable them to apply their acquired skills. Where the political support had not been secured, for example with mayors of local governments where ESM participants attempted to introduce reforms in revenue mobilization, their efforts failed. Holding multiple SPS and ESM seminars may not be possible for all countries given EDINU's limit on resources. But some kind of follow-up with the different

actors, whether in policy-making, policy-influencing or policy implementing roles is critical to producing sustainable impacts.

6.10 In fact, one-time training events have rarely resulted in impact beyond those of increased knowledge, skills and contacts for individuals unless there was some kind of follow-up support for their actions when they returned to their job. While impacts on individuals are not negligible, EDINU aims at creating conditions for policy innovation and improved sector management. We have seen that these require a favorable policy environment and institutional capacity to implement. Impacts on policy and on management practices have been noted when, following these seminars, World Bank negotiations were going on or participants were involved in World Bank supported projects, or where donor agencies provided funding, equipment and technical assistance on-the-job to increase their capacity to implement policy and management approaches. EDINU's Urban Sector has systematically invited donors to participate in their training activities. Contacts established with donors have led to numerous cases of funding of initiatives undertaken by participants. Follow-up by a World Bank officer involved in the SSATP initiative dealt effectively with interference from political levels to a recommendation made by an SPS participant for an increase in the Road maintenance budget.

6.11 Such findings have profound implications for EDINU, for EDI as a whole, and for the World Bank. EDI is only one player in policy development processes in SSA. In the context of structural adjustment, conditionalities attached to World Bank loans and the internal policy environment have more influence on policy options adopted by governments than do EDI seminars. EDI's limited resources also preclude possibilities of systematic and sustained in-country on-the-job follow-up, combined with financial support which is necessary to build up institutional capacity within Ministries and Local Governments. This kind of support is usually provided by World Bank or donor funded projects.

6.12 Findings of this evaluation suggest that EDINU has played an instrumental and facilitating role in furthering the dialogue between policy makers and with the World Bank, in some cases bringing parties closer together in defining policy options. EDINU has created fora for dialogue where they didn't exist. ESM seminars have resulted in increased skills in financial analysis and planning that have been supportive of and used in World Bank sector projects in SSA, particularly where training capacity in those skills was not available in the region. EDI brings with it the credibility and prestige of the World Bank but also a reputation of being open to dialogue and new ideas. EDI interventions and Bank operations are mutually supportive and can create a substantial impact when coordinated. Finally, EDINU has also facilitated links with donor agencies

which have resulted in funding for projects supportive of policy and sector management reforms. These constitute EDINU's comparative advantage.

6.13 From this observation, it follows that EDINU should rely on its comparative advantage to:

- . link World Bank operations with EDI's expertise in process facilitation so as to be more effective. Cooperation on identification of policy issues to be pursued in given countries, on identification of target groups, on content and follow up of strategies would go a long way to helping EDINU focus their interventions and create better conditions for sustained impact. World Bank operations may find more motivation in cooperating with EDI if its interventions are seen as supportive of Operations rather than as independent activities.

- . expand on the "broker" role with donors to coordinate their efforts in the setting up of co-financed program where each makes use of its comparative advantage. One of the most important blockages to policy implementation has been identified by the World Bank as the capacity of sector institutions to implement new policies. Large sums of money are available but the channels are not always known and donors often operate at cross-purposes.

6.14 We have shown that sustainable impact on policy innovations and improved sector management require focused, sustained and coordinated efforts. EDI's own structure , funding mechanisms and reward systems contains institutional constraints to the realization of such impacts:

- . EDINU Officers are spread out too thin. One or two officers per sector can superficially cover the world but cannot effectively ensure the kind of sustained activity and follow-up required for impact in given countries. Focusing on fewer regions or countries would be more in line with their limited resources but may not be possible or desirable.

- . Sustained efforts require substantial long-term funding. Officers spend an inordinate amount of their time seeking co-financing for individual activities. This type of co-financing is time consuming , often has conditionalities attached to it which may affect selection of participants and content . EDI must work out alternative funding mechanisms which would ensure sufficient funding for programs covering multiple activities , as well as the required investments in consultation and follow-up activities. Funding for the EDI/World Bank/multiple donor funded program such as the SSATP Road Maintenance Initiative is a good example. Long-term co-funding with one or two donor agencies may be also beneficial , where objectives coincide and each party can complement the other's activities .

. Impacts are difficult to assess unless objectives are clear and systematic monitoring and follow-up are included as legitimate activities which feed into the ongoing operations of EDI and are rewarded accordingly. Provided financial and other constraints are dealt with, reward systems should be reviewed to systematically encourage officers to plan integrated activities leading to greater impact, to consult and coordinate efforts with other divisions of EDI and of the World Bank and to systematically follow up.

. EDI divisions are fragmented: exchange between sectors and with other departments of the World Bank occur on an individual basis but are not institutionalized. This not only leads to fragmentation of interventions but prevents EDI and other sections of the World Bank from learning from results of each others' activities as a basis to improve on them, with the ultimate aim of increasing their impact.

Impact of EDINU Activities on Strengthening Capabilities of Training Institutions

To what extent has EDINU succeeded in developing capabilities of African partner institutions to offer programs in key aspects of infrastructure policy and sector management?

6.15 In the case of ESAMI, this was done to a great extent. Our findings indicate that the type of sustained support using a variety of approaches which reflected the needs of the institution at each point in time has indeed contributed to the development of ESAMI's capabilities to offer programs in Transport. Technical assistance yielded new programs in Transport Management. Advice and assistance in marketing helped ESAMI launch what are now regular transport course offerings in the region. Ongoing cooperation in finding resource persons and providing technical materials after technical assistants left has contributed to high quality courses with a solid technical base. Organization of a donors' conference in 1988 led to salary support for three African staff who have modified and expanded on the curriculum to reflect the needs of their client base and to put more emphasis on policy issues. At the end of the salary support period, these staff members will remain with ESAMI. As a result of these efforts, ESAMI has a qualified complement of staff and a comprehensive program in various aspects of transport management and policy, leading ESAMI to officially open its African Transport Management Studies Centre in April of this year.

6.16 On the other hand, collaboration on logistics and delivery of training activities has had little or no impact on the development of African partner institutions' capability to

offer programs in key aspects of infrastructure policy and sector management. While participation of partner institutions was found to have increased their credibility, provided them visibility and marketing opportunities which in some cases led to contracts with donors, it did not result in the strengthening of their management and training skills base.

6.17 Most training institutes in SSA are not in a position to replicate part of or whole programs organized by EDINU. In most cases, they lack autonomy, human, financial and material resources. Institutions assessed were at different stages in their development and expressed different needs.: ENA in Abidjan needed financial support; EAU was seeking credibility as a key institution in the Network to help fight it's battle for autonomy and legitimacy; CRAU needed training in Urban Finance and Management for one of their staff and micro-computers; AfDB/TC needed to sort out its internal problems, to clarify its mandate and resource availability ; ESAMI now wants donor agencies and the World Bank to treat them as equal partners in design and delivery of seminars in Africa. Bilateral collaboration on seminars has been supply-driven and opportunity-based, not oriented towards meeting institutions' needs. Expectations and goals of EDINU and those of partner institutions have been high on both sides and results have been disappointing to both sides.

6.18 Lack of a systematic assessment of partner institutions' needs and of their existing capabilities on the one hand, and of realistic possibilities of EDINU support on the other, has been part of the problem. Although the 1984 EDI Operational Plan had anticipated that Institutional Assessments would be carried out, few could be found for the institutions with which EDINU collaborated over the period. Some EDINU staff questioned whether institutional assessments are worthwhile. In our view, serious institution building efforts, just as any training effort, must be based on a good assessment of needs and a clarity of realistic objectives. Institution needs assessments need not be extremely time consuming and expensive but should be carried out with the participation of partner institutions in SSA.

6.19 Many collaborating institutions in SSA expect and need financial and material resources such as computers. EDINU has limited resources, yet it cannot ignore these institutions' constraints if it is seriously committed to developing their capacity. Donors who have similar aims will have to increasingly pool their resources. Uncoordinated efforts of donors (including the World Bank and EDI) leads to duplication, a waste of resources and often operates at cross-purposes within institutions. EDINU has demonstrated that it can play a useful coordinating role through the organization of donor's conferences or in seeking collaborative arrangements with other donor agencies.

6.20 Beyond assistance in dealing with financial and material constraints, EDINU can make a useful contribution in assisting in the development of content expertise and training of trainers through its seminars. However, EDINU must make an assessment of what is needed and of the appropriate approach for given institutions. An improvement of skills in management, design and delivery of seminars will not automatically occur through osmosis but requires an assessment of the existing level of skill, clear objectives to be pursued and follow-up.

6.21 Considerable effort has been invested in the development of training materials, the introduction of innovative methods and Training of Trainers in the hope that these would result in a multiplier effect. ToTs have been delivered in the Urban and Water sectors (impact of the latter could not be assessed). Transport included some trainers in their ESMs. Participants from all three sectors have reported modifying parts of their courses to include concepts and information from World Bank and EDINU materials. Following a ToT in Kenya, ZIPAM designed and delivered a one-week course on Urban Finance and Management using some EDI and World Bank documents. However, other full-time trainers did not report any improvements in their skills as trainers and have not developed or delivered courses since their return in their institution. ToTs in Urban will result in the production and dissemination of training materials to be published shortly.

6.22 That full-time trainers reported no increase or application of training skills following ToTs is not surprising. ToTs brought together "producers" and "users" to assist in the design of training materials to be disseminated by UNCHS and EDINU when completed. Very little time was devoted in these seminars to actually developing skills in needs assessment, design and delivery of training materials. If ToTs are to result in improvement of analysis, design and communication skills of trainers, the approach must be reevaluated to focus on trainers' needs. Strengthening training institutions' capabilities is a long-term process requiring sustained and focused efforts. It requires pre-activity contact with the leadership of institutions, the working out of an integrated plan to develop skills, the provision of consultancies and materials, and follow-up visits. All this takes time and is better handled with sustained efforts in-country. Given constraints, the "consortium of donors approach", each with its comparative advantage, may be the most promising one.

6.23 Exposure to computer and audio-visual technology and methods have opened trainers eyes to alternatives to traditional approaches but could not result in transfer of skills because equipment is generally not available. Skills not applied shortly after courses will in all likelihood be forgotten. A judgement needs to be made weighing the benefits of exposure to computer and audio-visual technology as a motivator for individual trainers to undertake efforts to access these technologies, versus the frustration and inability to apply which may occur if they cannot secure the equipment. Given these circumstances,

it may be more realistic to focus on currently available technology. Another option is to coordinate efforts with donors who could provide such equipment to participants' institutions.

6.24 Materials produced by EDINU are powerful tools in the hands of participants. Documents such as SPS proceedings, ESM country reports, World Bank facts, figures and graphs distributed in EDINU seminars, and the forthcoming manual on Urban Finance and Management can all serve to reinforce ideas introduced in seminars, thereby multiplying their effect. But in order to be useful and have an impact, they must be produced in a timely fashion. Participants in the 1988 ToT are still waiting for the training manual on Urban Finance two years later. SPS participants in Transport (SSATP) and Urban wanted to use proceedings to give credibility to their arguments in the continuing dialogue in their country but still had not received them.

6.25 EDINU must weigh the need for quality documents against their timeliness. We have demonstrated that timing is crucial in policy processes. Portable computer technology and desktop publishing offer low-cost, good quality solutions to this problem. Perhaps EDINU could explore the use of a portable computer to produce on location proceedings, points of consensus and country reports. Such an approach would allow participants to validate and take ownership of the content. It would also allow them to take documents away at the end of sessions so they may be used as soon as they are needed. Finally, it would have the added benefit of reducing mailing costs. Feasibility of this and other options should be examined if materials are to produce their full impact.

6.26 Last but not least of the efforts undertaken by EDINU has been the attempt at reinforcing the capabilities of institutions to provide training in Urban Finance and Management in West Africa. The attempt failed but not because there was no need for a Network. Networks have proven to be a powerful strategy for building capacity and have worked in Africa as a substitute for regional institutions where they don't exist. The IDRC-managed Macro-Economic Network in East Africa brings together researchers in regional seminars, follows up with working groups studying specific issues, disseminates information, provides possibilities of exchange of staff and of documents. Given the multitude of institutions and a substantial number of isolated but dynamic individuals who could make important contributions to advancing policy processes, some coordination is necessary and useful.

6.27 IDRC's 10 years of experience in establishing functioning Networks in SSA suggests that no single strategy or model is applicable to all situations. Rather, the approach depends on the needs of the sector and the conditions in the country. Perhaps the

objective of the Urban Network was not clear enough to mobilize those who already participate in the "Réseau d'Institutions de Formation en Urbanisme" to invest in another forum. Furthermore, given the constant preoccupation of institutions with their own survival, the assumption that they would spontaneously take on responsibility for it has again and again been proven to be wrong.

6.28 Interviews with IDRC program officers who have been involved in developing Networks in SSA have revealed that 3 conditions must be present for Networks to have a chance at succeeding:

- . **leadership and coordination:** A dynamic facilitator is needed for the first few years to go around and encourage the various actors and to create a stake in the Network. Leadership and coordination will not evolve in a context where institutions compete for their survival.

- . **a functioning secretariat:** Who handles the coordination requires analysis and can vary. For example, the secretariat of the Macro-Economic Network in East Africa secretariat resides in IDRC. A similar Network in West Africa is led by a consortium of donor, but the secretariat resides in CODESRIA which reports to the consortium.

- . **funding:** In all cases, there is a need to provide at least a minimum amount of "seed money" to recognize institutions' contributions, and to provide equipment, stamps, a travel budget, etc. The East Africa Macro-Economic Network is multi-donor funded at a cost of \$3,500,000 for 36 months of which \$300,000 is World Bank money. It has been funded for the last 10 years. The West Africa "Réseau sur les politiques industrielles et les incitations sectorielles" is co-funded with CIDA at a total cost of \$3,000,000 for 39 months.

6.29 As in other areas of institutional capacity building, EDINU does not have the financial resources to undertake such ambitious projects but it does have the credibility and the skills to facilitate consortium-funded networks which could serve to strengthen the capabilities of African training institutions. Involving potential member institutions in defining the needs for such a network is essential. Equally as important, EDINU must take on a leadership role in providing impetus to this kind of activity if it is to have any chance of succeeding.

6.30 EDINU's experience in institution building over the last five years has yielded modest successes. Institution building in SSA is difficult, time consuming and costly. The one success story, ESAMI, demonstrates just how comprehensive and sustained an effort must be done

to achieve the observed results. EDINU lacks the essential human and financial resources to sustain what, by its nature is a very long term process. Although development agencies around the world have adopted capacity building as one of their priorities, the fact remains that not much is known about how to go about it. What is clear however, is that whatever is done in institution building must be focussed, sustained and followed up so that we may learn how to do it better. And it must include African partner institutions in the process of assessing the needs, the objectives and the results.

CHAPTER 7

RECOMMENDATIONS

In Chapter 6, our analysis of findings and discussion of implications for EDINU, EDI and the World Bank have pointed to areas of comparative advantage and strengths, and to issues that must be addressed if EDINU wants to improve its impact in policy and institutional development. Specific suggestions have been made on how to improve impact of activities on each objective. In this Chapter, we conclude with a set of recommendations which, in our view, may contribute to improving EDINU's work.

Recommendation 1:

That EDINU shift from organizing discrete training events to developing 3 to 5 year sector programs.

Building of institutional capacity and policy reform are long-term processes in SSA. If it is intended that activities have policy and institutional capacity building impacts, then a much more focused, strategic approach, backed up by adequate resources will be required. Programs need not be cast in stone five years in advance. Such an approach would preclude flexibility to adapt to changing needs. Rather, what is needed is a clear idea of what realistic impacts EDINU can attain in a 3 to 5 year period in given regions, countries or institutions (clear and specific objectives), and a strategic framework to guide activities which could be sustained over the period. Country efforts must entail a well designed package of initiatives over a reasonable planning horizon, so that trainees can be targeted, and sustained linkages between a critical mass of managers and policy makers can be forged.

Recommendation 2

That EDINU focus the content and target population of training activities for greater impact.

. Focus seminars on fewer countries facing similar policy and sector management concerns, and with comparable levels of development and policy environments. Larger country teams facing similar policy issues may lead to generation of more specific and applicable policy alternatives.

. Where the policy environment is favourable in a given country , hold seminars in that country bringing together key stakeholders in the process, including Ministries of Finance and the private sector, with a view of defining applicable alternatives for that country. Identification of key stakeholders should be done in consultation with the World Bank Resident Missions and some government ministries. Select by invitation where it is possible. Finally, bring in World Bank officers from the region or country and donors so as to facilitate dialogue and follow-up with relevant individuals in ministries.

. Focus on topics which can be dealt with in-depth during the given period of time so that policy options and alternatives may be discussed in applicable terms. Topics such as "current policy issues in urban transport" or "mobilization of financial resources from the informal sector" could bring together participants from many countries in coming up with quite specific alternative solutions. Policy issue conferences of this kind could also usefully bring together participants from both francophone and anglophone African countries in learning from each others' experience.

. Target seminars to the appropriate levels in the policy process. Selection of individuals who are in a position to implement knowledge or skills introduced in the seminars should be done carefully. While interaction between policy-makers, those who influence policy and those who implement is necessary, mixing levels of individuals with different concerns and expectations throughout the seminars becomes counter-productive. Where such interaction is desirable, the Two-Tier Approach may be a suitable option.

Recommendation 3:

That EDINU systematically ensure follow-up on its activities

Follow-up activities are legitimate and necessary components of an integrated approach to building capabilities of organizations and institutions. Agricultural extension work has demonstrated the benefits of follow-up activities to monitor, reinforce knowledge and skills and assess the next steps to be taken. Follow-up of country action-plans a year or two after participants have returned to work, follow-up of regional seminars with national seminars bringing together key actors in the process, follow-up of ESMs with SPSs and vice-versa, facilitation of ongoing dialogue through funding of exchanges and dissemination of an alumni bulletin have all been suggested as possible options.

EDINU should also study alternatives proposed in this report to ensure timely dissemination of seminar proceedings and country reports after a course so they may be used by participants.

Monitoring and follow-up activities should be included as legitimate activities which feed into ongoing operations of EDINU and should be rewarded accordingly.

Recommendation 4:

That EDINU systematically assess partner institutions' needs and their existing capabilities as a basis to determine the type of interventions which are required to lead to capacity-building.

This implies a shift from a largely supply-driven approach where institutions collaborate on EDINU's mandate to deliver courses, to a more needs-driven approach where EDINU and partner institutions systematically assess their mutual needs and capabilities and determine the appropriate strategy to adopt in a given period of time. Serious institution building efforts must be based on good assessments of needs and a clarity of realistic objectives. Where institutions have a broad mandate (for example, management training institutes), needs assessments and activities should be coordinated with other relevant divisions of EDI.

As is the case for training activities aiming at policy impacts, institution building activities must be focused, sustained and followed up. And they must include African partner institutions in the process of assessing the needs, the objectives and the results. Finally, EDINU may play a useful role in coordinating the efforts of the various donors involved in institution strengthening activities so as to pool resources and limit duplication.

Recommendation 5:

That EDINU increase its collaboration with other divisions of EDI, with operational departments of the World Bank and with donors by

. encouraging exchanges of experiences between sectors and divisions by creating fora for such exchanges and making them a legitimate and necessary part of the job. This would allow EDI sectors and divisions to learn from each others' interventions as a basis to improve them, with the ultimate goal of increasing impact.

. cooperating with the World Bank operations on identification of policy issues in given countries, on identification of target groups, on content and on follow-up strategies. This

would go a long way to helping EDINU focus its interventions and create better conditions for impact. The Road Maintenance Initiative of the SSATP provides a good example of the kind of cooperation between EDI sector activities and World Bank operations that could lead to greater impact. World Bank operations may in fact find more motivation in cooperating with EDI if its interventions are seen to be supportive of operations rather than as independent activities.

Recommendation 6:

That the World Bank address EDI's institutional constraints to increasing impact on policy and institutional capacity building.

In our view, it is unlikely that the recommendations made in this report can be fully implemented unless EDI's financial and human resource constraints are addressed. We have pointed out that officers of EDINU are spread out very thinly. One or two officers per sector cannot provide the type of sustained activity (including consultations, needs assessments, monitoring and follow-up) which is necessary for substantial impact on policy in given countries or institutions.

Officers spend a substantial part of their time seeking co-financing to organize each training activity. This type of co-financing is time consuming, often has conditionalities attached to it which may affect selection of participants and content. If EDI is expected to genuinely play an effective role in policy and institution building, then human resources and budgetary changes will be required. If staffing or funding levels cannot be adjusted, then the World Bank may have to reassess its expectations of EDI's possible impact. In any case, the nature of the partnership with the World Bank must be discussed and consolidated.